

Title: [My Great Grandfather China Sea Phil](#)

2021 Festival Award: [Best of Show](#)

Student(s): Tommy Dilger

Judged by: Jason Roche, Professor, documentary filmmaker



## 2021 Michigan Student Film Festival - Judging Feedback

**Important Note:** *The following numeric scores are provided by the first-round judges for student feedback only. Scores were not used to tabulate total scores for award consideration. Detailed feedback and scores were used in final judging rounds to determine overall award.*

**Overall Concept:** [5 of 5](#) *Is the central idea original? Is it age-appropriate? Does it consider a diverse audience?*

**Narrative Structure:** [5 of 5](#) *Is there a logical development of the story? Is it well-planned? If experimental, is there still a sense of unity?*

### **Technical Areas**

**Cinematography:** [2 of 3](#) *Was the camerawork supportive of the theme? Were varied composition and angle techniques used?*

**Editing:** [3 of 3](#) *Was the assembly of scenes and angles supportive of the theme?*

**Lighting:** [2 of 3](#) *Was the project's lighting supportive of the theme? Did it enhance the work?*

**Sound:** [3 of 3](#) *Was sound quality appropriate? Did it detract or enhance the work?*

### **Shout-Outs:**

*This may be the best student project I've ever seen. Wonderful, compelling mix of photos, audio, animation, writing, interviews. I watched the whole thing, some parts twice. This is a mammoth success. I hope it will become a treasured heirloom for your family and a springboard for your career as a documentary filmmaker and writer. Technical elements are perfect (except for the lamp behind Nonny's head). Enter this in as many festivals as you can. Bravo.*

### **Suggested Areas for Improvement:**

*These suggestions may seem incredibly picky, but I offer them to help make this stellar project a tiny bit better. In the radio interview the transcription says "side door poohmans." The actual term is side-door Pullman. And one minor suggestion for editing. After you mention the cup of tea and we see your grandmother again, it's redundant to have her say that he went back to his house in Florida when he died. Instead, pick up the sound bite when she says "and again, that's where the cousin found him...."*

Title: My Great Grandfather China Sea Phil

2021 Festival Award: Best of Show

Student(s): Tommy Dilger

Judged by: Kyle Minch , DGA Assistant Director // Production Manager



## 2021 Michigan Student Film Festival - Judging Feedback

**Important Note:** *The following numeric scores are provided by the first-round judges for student feedback only. Scores were not used to tabulate total scores for award consideration. Detailed feedback and scores were used in final judging rounds to determine overall award.*

**Overall Concept:** 4 of 5 *Is the central idea original? Is it age-appropriate? Does it consider a diverse audience?*

**Narrative Structure:** 5 of 5 *Is there a logical development of the story? Is it well-planned? If experimental, is there still a sense of unity?*

### Technical Areas

**Cinematography:** 2 of 3 *Was the camerawork supportive of the theme? Were varied composition and angle techniques used?*

**Editing:** 3 of 3 *Was the assembly of scenes and angles supportive of the theme?*

**Lighting:** 2 of 3 *Was the project's lighting supportive of the theme? Did it enhance the work?*

**Sound:** 3 of 3 *Was sound quality appropriate? Did it detract or enhance the work?*

### Shout-Outs:

*I loved the use of multi media within the documentary medium, not just keeping it the "Ken Burns" style the entire time. I really enjoyed the typography portion.*

### Suggested Areas for Improvement:

*Length, it was such an amazing piece but a lot of the points were rather drawn out and the entire thing could have been condensed.*

Title: My Great Grandfather China Sea Phil

2021 Festival Award: Best of Show

Student(s): Tommy Dilger

Judged by: Annette Frank, Arts Administrator



## 2021 Michigan Student Film Festival - Judging Feedback

**Important Note:** *The following numeric scores are provided by the first-round judges for student feedback only. Scores were not used to tabulate total scores for award consideration. Detailed feedback and scores were used in final judging rounds to determine overall award.*

**Overall Concept:** 5 of 5 *Is the central idea original? Is it age-appropriate? Does it consider a diverse audience?*

**Narrative Structure:** 5 of 5 *Is there a logical development of the story? Is it well-planned? If experimental, is there still a sense of unity?*

### **Technical Areas**

**Cinematography:** 3 of 3 *Was the camerawork supportive of the theme? Were varied composition and angle techniques used?*

**Editing:** 3 of 3 *Was the assembly of scenes and angles supportive of the theme?*

**Lighting:** 3 of 3 *Was the project's lighting supportive of the theme? Did it enhance the work?*

**Sound:** 3 of 3 *Was sound quality appropriate? Did it detract or enhance the work?*

### **Shout-Outs:**

*Amazing story and incredibly well told. You were blessed with a treasure trove of materials that you clearly researched and presented coherently. Your voice over narration is solid and you brought out good stories from your grandma. And I a person who watches the credits all the way through and yours were terrific - I especially appreciated your shout out to the guy who saved your hard drive and the final coda with Phil doing his San Francisco poem. This is a stunning accomplishment and I hope to follow your further career in film.*

### **Suggested Areas for Improvement:**

*My first concern is that title text with photo behind knocked out letters was too hard to read. There is some confusion in the sequence where he dies - he's sitting in chair on NYE and then grandma says he went back to house, but he was already there so just delete that part.*

Title: [My Great Grandfather China Sea Phil](#)

2021 Festival Award: [Best of Show](#)

Student(s): Tommy Dilger

Judged by: [Andrea Willis, Retired Teacher](#)



## 2021 Michigan Student Film Festival - Judging Feedback

**Important Note:** *The following numeric scores are provided by the first-round judges for student feedback only. Scores were not used to tabulate total scores for award consideration. Detailed feedback and scores were used in final judging rounds to determine overall award.*

**Overall Concept:** [5 of 5](#) *Is the central idea original? Is it age-appropriate? Does it consider a diverse audience?*

**Narrative Structure:** [5 of 5](#) *Is there a logical development of the story? Is it well-planned? If experimental, is there still a sense of unity?*

### Technical Areas

**Cinematography:** [3 of 3](#) *Was the camerawork supportive of the theme? Were varied composition and angle techniques used?*

**Editing:** [3 of 3](#) *Was the assembly of scenes and angles supportive of the theme?*

**Lighting:** [3 of 3](#) *Was the project's lighting supportive of the theme? Did it enhance the work?*

**Sound:** [3 of 3](#) *Was sound quality appropriate? Did it detract or enhance the work?*

### Shout-Outs:

*You need to keep filming stories. You are a gifted filmmaker.*

### Suggested Areas for Improvement:

*Excellent film...very beautifully done. I felt your enthusiasm and love for this project.*

Title: My Great Grandfather China Sea Phil

2021 Festival Award: Best of Show

Student(s): Tommy Dilger

Judged by: Nancy Gilliland , retired art teacher



## 2021 Michigan Student Film Festival - Judging Feedback

**Important Note:** *The following numeric scores are provided by the first-round judges for student feedback only. Scores were not used to tabulate total scores for award consideration. Detailed feedback and scores were used in final judging rounds to determine overall award.*

**Overall Concept:** 5 of 5 *Is the central idea original? Is it age-appropriate? Does it consider a diverse audience?*

**Narrative Structure:** 5 of 5 *Is there a logical development of the story? Is it well-planned? If experimental, is there still a sense of unity?*

### Technical Areas

**Cinematography:** 3 of 3 *Was the camerawork supportive of the theme? Were varied composition and angle techniques used?*

**Editing:** 3 of 3 *Was the assembly of scenes and angles supportive of the theme?*

**Lighting:** 3 of 3 *Was the project's lighting supportive of the theme? Did it enhance the work?*

**Sound:** 3 of 3 *Was sound quality appropriate? Did it detract or enhance the work?*

### Shout-Outs:

*Excellent work!! This film is very well done and of superb quality; a professional creation. The scenes were so well varied and kept my interest. Excellent idea to lay the photos on the newspaper background. The interview interspersed with the other film edits keeps the audience's attention. So clever with the sound clips! To diversify the way they were presented was genius and it never allowed the audience to become bored with your Great Grandfather's interview. Gathering a wide range of material made your Great Grandfather really take shape and form and allowed the audience to see and understand him as a very real and well rounded individual. (you must have felt that way too). Thank you it's important people from our pasts become known and not forgotten. Excellent ending credits - well paced. Beautiful recorded poem to end your film. Excellent - I hope you continue.*

### Suggested Areas for Improvement:

*Maybe I missed something but I couldn't find any areas for improvement*